

Five species of argument structure

| | | CER McNeill 2006 | | ABCD Frensley 2019 | REASoN | 1 st species | 2 nd species | 3 rd species | 4 th species | 5 th species |
|---|-------------------|-------------------|---|---------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|-------------------------|
| | | Style 1 | Style 2 | | | Simple pairings | Analyze constancy and change with more or less detail | Argue from contradiction | | |
| Toulmin 1958 | | | | | | Use substitution / transitive property to show that two quantities have equal value | Qualitatively analyze by distinguishing among broad categories of increase, decrease, remain the same | Quantitatively analyze by using algebraic symbols (e.g. exponents) to distinguish among subcategories (e.g. increasing by doubling vs. increasing by quadrupling) | Describe a conflict that would occur in a hypothetical scenario and a resolution of the conflict | Combine |
| Backing (authority of warrant) | <u>E</u> vidence | <u>R</u> easoning | <u>B</u> asic principles | <u>R</u> elationship | According to N2L, | According to N2L, | According to the definition of kinetic energy, | According to N2L, | | |
| Warrant (rule, relationship, or tool used to get from data to claim) | | | | | $a_y = \frac{\sum F_y}{m_1}$ | $a_x = \frac{\sum F_x}{m}$ | $K = \frac{1}{2}mv^2$, an object's kinetic energy is proportional to the object's mass and proportional to the square of the object's speed. | the net inward force $\sum F_{IN}$ (provided by the gravitational force, $F_G = \frac{GMm}{r^2}$, which is inversely proportional to r^2) equals the product $m \cdot \frac{v^2}{r}$ (which is inversely proportional to r) of the mass of the moon m and radially inward acceleration $a_{IN} = \frac{v^2}{r}$. | | |
| Data/Grounds | | <u>E</u> vidence | <u>C</u> onnect to situation (<u>c</u> ompare, <u>c</u> ontrast, <u>c</u> ite) | <u>E</u> qual/same | The net y-force equals $F_G = m_G g$. | The mass of the object was the same in both experiments. | The mass of the object was the same in both experiments. | The masses are the same in both scenarios. If the speed v also stayed unchanged | | |
| | | | | <u>A</u> ltered/different | | The net force was stronger in the 2 nd experiment. | The speed of the object in the 2 nd experiment was double the speed of the object in the 1 st experiment. | even while the distance r between the center of the planet and the center of the small moon were increased, | | |
| Claim | <u>R</u> easoning | <u>C</u> laim | <u>D</u> raw ideas together into assertion | <u>S</u> o what? | So, the y-acceleration $a_y = \frac{m_G g}{m_1}$ equals the ratio of the product of the object's gravitational mass and the gravitational acceleration to the object's inertial mass. | So, the magnitude of the acceleration was greater in the 2 nd experiment. | So, the kinetic energy of the object was quadrupled in the 2 nd experiment. | both the gravitational force expression $\frac{GMm}{r^2}$ and the product $m \cdot \frac{v^2}{r}$ of mass and acceleration would have smaller magnitude, but the gravitational force expression would have smaller magnitude than the product of mass and acceleration. | | |
| | <u>C</u> laim | | <u>A</u> nswer / <u>A</u> ssertion | | | | | So, to keep the gravitational force expression $\frac{GMm}{r^2}$ and the product $m \cdot \frac{v^2}{r}$ of mass and acceleration equal, the speed v must also decrease. | | |
| | | | | Any quantity to analyze <u>N</u> ext? | | | | | | 5 |